

**Report on: ‘Can the Seamless Garment be Sewn?’ Dialogue #1**

The Office of Human Life and Dignity

Diocese of Tucson

Monday, November 22nd, 2010

Present: Katie Hirschboeck, Joanne Welter, Jean Fedigan, Laura Stehle, Anita Timpani, BethAnn Johnson, Peg Harmon, Melanie Nelson, Michael Berger, Gen Padilla , Scott Wilson, Frank Pierson, Msgr. Tom Cahalane

The Background

This dialogue evolved over the past three years . . . *need to finish the background*

## The Invitation

*Subject: Can the seamless Garment be Sewn?*

*Date: Tue, 10 Aug 2010 15:46:46 -0700*

*From: jwelter@diocesetucson.org*

*Greetings each and all!*

*That is the major question: Can the seamless garment be sewn?*

*As persons working for Social Justice we have not been able to understand how to work with persons who are Involved with the issue of Right to Life. The challenge is to get better at this...and here is an idea.*

*I would like to invite you (Katie, Mike, Frank and I have said yes) to be in a dialogue group that will meet no more than 2 times.*

*You will get a packet of readings from a Symposium...entitled – Can the Seamless Garment be Sewn? The Future of Pro-Life Progressivism. You will find talks by John Carr of the USCCB, Thomas Berg, Professor of Law at the St. Thomas School of Law, Rev. Jim Wallis, Sidney Callahan, Ph.D, Susan Appleton, Professor of Law of the Washington University in St. Louis, Helen Alvare, Catholic U, Professor of Law, John O Callaghan, U of Notre Dame, Mark Sargent, Villanova U School of Law, Ted Jelen, Prof. of Political Science at the U of Nevada...*

*Katie Hirschboeck will copy the talks for each person who will join in this important dialogue. We will make arrangements for you to pick up the talks either here at the Diocesan Pastoral Center or at OMOS. I will take care of the expense of the copying as this department will*

*We might not get to being together for a month and a half due to the start up work of the Fall, for each of us. That will give you time to read the talks.*

*Then we will set a date for a 2 hour discussion gathering. The next gathering we decide upon will be a time to invite Bishop*

*To be with us to dialogue around this important theme. This Office of Human Life and Dignity will profit from our dialogue and I believe that you will also gain from this venture.*

*Let me know if you are willing to join in this dialogue.*

*Grateful, Joanne*

Participants were asked to reflect on the following questions as they read the articles:

**Some Reflection/Discussion/Dialogue Questions**

*Can the Seamless Garment Be Sewn? The Future of Pro-Life Progressivism*

*Each of the authors presented some unique arguments regarding different aspects of pro-life progressivism. We'll assume that you were more comfortable with some of these arguments and positions than others, so let's probe this more deeply . . .*

1. Which of the articles resonated with you the most ? Why?
2. Which of the articles challenged you the most? Why ?
3. Were there any arguments that you found especially compelling even though you may not fully agree with some aspects of their conclusions?
4. Were there any arguments that you found especially weak, even though you *do* agreed with their conclusions?
5. Select one quote from any of the readings that “spoke to you” in an affirming way and one quote that “spoke to you” in a challenging way.
6. What life issues do you struggle with the most? What are the roots of this struggle?
7. The article by Ted Jelen contains some sobering statistics about the paucity of “consistent ethic of life” attitudes in both lay Catholics and priests. What do you think has contributed most to this? What suggestions do you have for remedying this situation?
8. The roles of politics and law come up in many of the articles and issues. Do you think the seamless garment / consistent ethic *gestalt*<sup>1</sup> can ever transcend these powerful forces? If so, how?
9. *Can* the seamless garment “be sewn?” Is there a future for pro-life progressivism in the Universal Church? The United States? Our Diocese?
10. Where do we go from here? What are some concrete steps that could be taken to further this dialogue?

---

<sup>1</sup> Term used by Ted Jelen in his article

**A Dialogue**

*The Office of Human Life and Dignity*

**Diocese of Tucson**

**Common Readings:**

**"Can the Seamless Garment Be Sewn? The future of Pro-Life Progressivism"**

**University of St. Thomas Law Journal**

**Dialogue (dinner included)**

**5:30 p.m. – 9:00 p.m. Monday, November 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2010**

**Bishop Moreno Diocesan Pastoral Center**

**Duce Maria Conference Room**

Dialogue Initiators/Leaders: Joanne Welter, Katie Hirschboeck

**Participants**

- ✓ **Mike Berger**  
Director, Office of Catechesis, Diocese of Tucson – and former Family Life Director for Diocese of Tucson: Santa Fe Province representative to the National Conference for Catechetical Leadership
- ✓ **Msgr. Tom Cahalane**  
Pastor, Our Mother of Sorrows
- ✓ **Jean Fedigan**  
Chief Nursing Officer, UA Healthcare, OMOS –Just Faith coordinator  
Lector, Consistent Ethic of Life, Eucharistic Minister
- ✓ **Peg Harmon**  
CEO, Catholic Community Services, Diocese of Tucson
- Tim Heinan**  
Ex. Dir. Blessed Nuno Society, Regina Cleri Knights of Columbus Council 5133, Sir Knight Archbishop Gercke Assembly fourth Degree OMOS –Chair, Consistent Ethic of Life Committee, Christian Life Commission Core committee Member, Just Faith Graduate
- ✓ **Katie Hirschboeck**  
Associate Professor of Climatology, Laboratory of Tree-Research and Chair, global Change Graduate Interdisciplinary Program, University of Arizona OMOS: Chair, Christian Life Commission, member: Consistent Ethic of Life committee, Care for Creation Initiative, Hait Committee, Lector, Just Faith Graduate – Originator of the Circle of Life Program (on the Consistent Ethic of Life)  
<http://www.circleoflifejourney.org/> - Originator: Justice & Peace shall
- Kiss Blog** <http://psalm85.blogspot.com/> and Holy Ground Common Ground website: <http://holygroundcommonground.blogspot.com/>
- ✓ **Beth Ann Johnson**  
Diocese of Tucson, JustFaith Coordinator, Office of Human Life and Dignity - Director, Casa San Juan Immigrant Center, St. John the Evangelist Parish – JustFaith Coordinator, St. Pius X Church
- ✓ **Melanie Nelson**  
Community Organizer, Pima County Interfaith Council

Jessica Pacheco	Regional Field Director, Promise Arizona
✓ Genevieve Padilla	Lead Community Organizer, Pima County Interfaith Council
✓ Frank Pierson	Chairman, Diocesan Pastoral Council, Diocese of Tucson Chairman, St. Helen (Oracle) Parish Council National Staff, IAF-Industrial Areas Foundation
Fr. Dominic Pinti	Diocesan director of Respect Life, Pastor, St George Parish
✓ Laura Stehle	OMOS Staff, Director of Religious Education for School and Parish, Parish Compliance Officer, Diocesan Catechetical Advisory Board Christian Education Formation Commission, Religious Ed Advisory Board, Christian Life Commission, Consistent Ethic of Life Committee, Liturgy Commission, Eucharistic Minister, Just Faith Graduate
✓ Anita Timpani	TIHAN Staff, Just Faith Graduate, St. Pius X
✓ Joanne Welter	Director, Office of Human Life and Dignity, Diocese of Tucson
✓ Scott Wilson	Chief, Internal Medicine, St. Mary's Hospital, Director, Hepatitis Clinic, El Rio Health Center OMOS-Haiti Committee, consistent Ethic of Life Committee and Lector

**A dialogue**  
*The office of Human Life and Dignity*  
**Diocese of Tucson**

**Monday, November 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2010**

**5:30 p.m. - 9:00 p.m.**

**Bishop Moreno Diocesan Pastoral Center**

**Duce Maria Conference Room**

*Dialogue Initiators/leaders: Katie Hirschboeck, Joanne Welter*

**5:00 - 5:30 p.m. Arrival**

**5:45 Dinner/Prayer Visual** - *Katie*

**6:15 Introduction of self, also name what compels you  
to be here this evening** - *Joanne*

**7:00 A reflection from each (3 min.) on one or two of the first eight  
questions. Others listen.** - *Joanne*

**7:45 Break**

**8:00 - 8:15 Responses to previous reflections** - *Katie*

**8:15 Bridging the Chasm: Naming positive actions that can move us forward  
(Questions 9-10)** - *Katie*

**8:45 Synthesis & Recommendations** - *Joanne*

**9:00 Determine meeting Date with Bishop Kicanas** - *Joanne*

**Closing: Prayer of the Circle of Life** - *Katie*

*Need to work on this WITH YOU a tad more:*

Positive Actions Dialogue Section: (As presented - to be refined)

1. Affirmation of Bishop Kicanas on Migration Attention. Keep speaking out Include Death Penalty.
2. Continued teaching of the 7 principles of Catholic Social Teaching.
3. Develop Adult Ed./Formation at Parish level.
4. Promote leadership/formation in parishes in dignity of all life.
5. Respect peoples stories, not political polls.
6. Develop personal ethics based on the Gospel.
7. Develop relationships based on love.
8. People need to know what the Church teaches (formation).
9. Wider use of 'Circle of Life Journey' Powerpoint reflections and program.
10. Bishop Kicanas provide a Pastoral Letter on the ~~Circle of Life program.~~ full spectrum of life issues, perhaps with examples drawn from the activities of the OMOS Consistent Ethic of Life Committee and its Circle of Life Journey Program
11. Develop tendency to listen, lessen tendency to inform.
12. Name the Culture of Fear – fear to share with the poor, Naming of sharing as 'socialist', not wanting immigrants In country, etc.
13. Incorporate everyday heroism.
14. Ask, how are you part of the fabric of a parish.
15. Promotion of the Hard Work of informing our conscience.
16. Education at homily.
17. New language of the Mass – seek to educate the changes toward A fuller conversion.
18. Develop the Thinking Catholic in contrast to the Functional Catholic.
18. Bringing of personal experiences to Altar (Mass), knowing the Social inadequacies of the community (lack of jobs, food, etc.)
19. Programs, Ex. JustFaith.
20. Opportunities for Parish, Diocesan personal sharings.
21. Invite conversion, transformation, engage people in actions, Use personal invitation.
22. How do we dialogue with strident 'pro-lifers'?
23. Can we begin one-on-one with key leaders in an appropriate setting (e.g. Terry Bueno of AZ Right to Life who just joined OMOS Consistent Ethic of Life Committee)

Fr. Pinti: *Input by Phone*

Suggests Prayer time for each group once a year (in parishes) Pro-life, Social Justice, Needy/poor/addicted, and Voting (Faithful Citizenship).

Suggests specific attention to the Beatitudes and the Precepts of the Church

Better enhancement of Pro-Life in the Month of October.

Lift up the role of Mother/Father, and a good family life style

Bishop or group have a statement 4 times a year (perhaps based on the 4 areas above)  
Have a committee working with the Bishop

Brochure for each parish on different Respect Life topics.